

Comment on “Comparison of new and existing threshold methods for evaluating sulfur compounds in different base wines”

Sierra Rayne^{a,*}

^a*Chemologica Research, 318 Rose Street, PO Box 74, Mortlach, Saskatchewan, Canada, S0H 3E0*

Keywords:

Wine, Sulfur aroma compounds, Regression

In Figure 6 of Cliff et al. [1], the authors plot the log mean aroma threshold concentrations for the three analytes on the y-axis against the qualitative descriptors of the wine (i.e., “model,” “neutral,” and “fruity”) on the x-axis, and proceed to fit three log-linear regression models through the sets of data. The statistical validity of this exercise seems problematic (particularly with only three datapoints, and four significant figures in the resulting quoted regression constants), and the reason behind this choice of data analysis is unclear. Some type of statistical test (e.g., ANOVA) designed to investigate relative trend differences between categorical variables would perhaps be more appropriate, especially when such nebulous categorical descriptors as “neutral” and “fruity” are being employed along the x-axis and ordered in an arbitrary manner.

References

- [1] M. Cliff, M. Bansal, K. Stanich, K. Usher, Comparison of new and existing threshold methods for evaluating sulfur compounds in different base wines, *Journal of Sensory Studies* 26 (2011) 184–196.

*Corresponding author. Tel.: +1 306 690 0573. E-mail address: sierra.rayne@live.co.uk (S. Rayne).