

Refutation of the definition of mutual information

Copyright © 2018 by Colin James III All rights reserved.

We assume the method and apparatus of Meth8/VL4 with Tautology as the designated *proof* value, F as contradiction, N as truthity (non-contingency), and C as falsity (contingency). Results are a 16-valued truth table in row-major and horizontal.

LET p, q, r : H; A, ; B,Y; \sim Not; & And; \setminus Not And; + Or; - Not Or; > Imply.

From: Wright, J. (2015). Lecture 18: Quantum information theory and Holevo's bound. cs.cmu.edu/~odonnell/quantum15/lecture18.pdf

"Definition 4.5 (Mutual Information). The mutual information $I(X;Y)$ between two random variables X and Y is $I(X;Y) = H(X) + H(Y) - H(X,Y)$. (1.1)

This is supposed to represent the amount of information one learns about X from knowing what Y is. Since the definition is symmetric in X and Y , it also represents the amount of information one learns about Y from knowing X ."

We evaluate the consequent of Eq. 1.1 as a potential theorem.

$((p\&q)+(p\&r))-(p\&(q\&r))$; T T T F T F T F T T T F T F T F (1.2)

Eq. 1.2 as rendered is *not* tautologous.

We evaluate the definition from another source: en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Mutual_information.

"Mutual information can be equivalently expressed as $I(X;Y) \equiv$

$H(X) - H(X|Y) \equiv$ (2.1)

$H(Y) - H(Y|X) \equiv$ (3.1)

$H(X) + H(Y) - H(X,Y) \equiv$ (4.1)

$H(X,Y) - H(X|Y) - H(Y|X)$. (5.1)

where $H(X)$ and $H(Y)$ are the marginal entropies, $H(X|Y)$ and $H(Y|X)$ are the conditional entropies, and $H(X,Y)$ is the joint entropy of X and Y ."

$(p\&q)-(p\&(q\&r))$; T F T F T F T F T F T F T F (2.2)

$(p\&r)-(p\&(r\&q))$; T F T F T F T F T F T F T F (3.2)

$((p\&q)+(p\&r))-(p\&(q\&r))$; T T T F T F T F T T T F T F T F (4.2)

$(p\&(q\&r))-((p\&(q\&r))-(p\&(r\&q)))$; F T F T F T F F F T F T F T F F (5.2)

Eqs. 2.2 and 3.2 are equivalent and 4.2 and 5.2 are not, but each is *not* tautologous. This means the definition of mutual information as stated is not confirmed and hence refuted.