A Brief Proof that Pi is Irrational

Timothy W. Jones

Abstract

It is shown that the limit of $\cos(j)$ and $\sin(j)$ as j goes to infinity does not exist. Using DeMoivre's theorem this implies the limits of $\sin(j!)$ and $\cos(j!)$ don't exist either. Assuming π is rational, its multiple can be expressed as a factorial. From this a contradiction is derived.

Proof

The following Lemma is taken from a youtube video: Dr. Barker video.

Lemma 1. The limits

$$\lim_{j \to \infty} \sin(j) \tag{1}$$

and

$$\lim_{j \to \infty} \cos(j) \tag{2}$$

don't exist.

Proof. Suppose (1) exists and equals L. Then

$$\lim_{j \to \infty} \sin(j+1) = \lim_{j \to \infty} \sin(j-1) = L.$$

Using trigonometric identities,

$$\sin(j+1) = \sin(j)\cos(1) + \cos(j)\sin(1)$$
(3)

and

$$\sin(j-1) = \sin(j)\cos(1) - \cos(j)\sin(1).$$
 (4)

Using (3), we solve for $\cos(j)$:

$$\cos(j) = \frac{\sin(j+1) - \sin(j)\cos(1)}{\sin(1)}.$$

This gives

$$\lim_{j \to \infty} \cos(j) = \frac{L - L\cos(1)}{\sin(1)} = \frac{L(1 - \cos(1))}{\sin(1)},$$
(5)

implying the limit of cos(j) exists. Similarly, using (4), we solve for cos(j)

$$\cos(j) = \frac{\sin(j)\cos(1) - \sin(j-1)}{\sin(1)}.$$

This gives

$$\lim_{j \to \infty} \cos(j) = \frac{L\cos(1) - L}{\sin(1)} = \frac{L(\cos(1) - 1)}{\sin(1)}.$$
 (6)

The only way (5) and (6) can be made consistent is if both limits are 0. Given that $1 - \cos(1) \neq 0$, this forces L = 0.

We now have

$$\lim_{j \to \infty} \sin(j) = \lim_{j \to \infty} \cos(j) = 0,$$

but this implies

$$\lim_{j \to \infty} \cos^2(j) + \sin^2(j) = 0,$$

contradicting the Pythagorean identity: giving 0 = 1. Therefore the limits, (1) and (2) don't exist.

Lemma 2.

$$\lim_{j \to \infty} \sin(j!)$$

does not exist.

Proof. If it did exist, then using DeMoivre's theorem

$$\lim_{j \to \infty} (\cos(j!) + i \sin(j!))^{1/(j-1)!} = \lim_{j \to \infty} (\cos(j) + i \sin(j))$$

would exist, contradicting 1.

Remarks

Powers of $e^{in} = \cos n + i \sin n$ spin a point on the unit circle. If n was ever equal to π then the point on the unit circle would be -1 and powers of this would cycle and make convergence impossible. On the other hand, if $2n = \pi$, $e^{i2n} = 1$ and all whole number powers of this equal one allowing convergence. These observations show that for whole number increments in cos and sin arguments evaluations must become constants in order for convergence to take place. We use this idea to prove π is irrational next.

Theorem 1. π *is irrational.*

Proof. Assume $\pi = p/q$, then there exists a first k! that has a factor of p in it and

$$n = k! \frac{q}{p}$$

for some integer n. This means $j! = m\pi$, and for all $j \ge k$ and some integer m. This implies $\sin(j!) = 0$ for all such j giving

$$\lim_{j \to \infty} \sin(j!) = 0,$$

contradicting Lemma 2.

References

- [1] I. Niven, A simple proof that π is irrational, *Bull. Amer. Math. Soc.* **53** (1947) 509.
- [2] _____, *Irrational Numbers*, Carus Mathematical Monographs, no. 11, Mathematical Association of America, Washington, DC, 1985.